



YORKSHIRE GARDENS TRUST

President: The Countess of Harewood

Vice-presidents: Lady Legard, Peter Goodchild, Nick Lane Fox

www.yorkshiregardentrust.org.uk

Mrs Val Hepworth

Trustee

Conservation and Planning

Ms Rachel Roddis
Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council
PO Box 634
Barnsley
S70 9GG
developmentmanagement@barnsley.gov.uk

conservation@yorkshiregardentrust.org.uk

19th April 2022

Dear Ms Roddis,

**2021/0852 Demolition of existing bungalow and erection of new dormer bungalow with detached one and half storey outbuilding and associated works Pine Lodge, Stainborough Lane, Hood Green, Barnsley, S75 3EZ
RECONSULTATION**

Thank you for reconsulting The Gardens Trust (GT) in its role as Statutory Consultee with regard to proposed development affecting Wentworth Castle, an historic designed landscape of national importance which is included by Historic England on the Register of Parks and Gardens of Special Historic Interest at Grade I. The Yorkshire Gardens Trust (YGT) is a member organisation of the GT and works in partnership with it in respect of the protection and conservation of registered sites, and is authorised by the GT to respond on GT's behalf in respect of such consultations.

As you know Wentworth Castle Park and Garden is of exceptional interest (around 9% of registered sites are Grade I) and is the only Grade I registered park and garden in South Yorkshire. It is significant for having so much of the early 18th century designed landscape surviving, for the political and ideological rivalry that was expressed in the landscape by the branches of the family at Wentworth Castle and Wentworth Woodhouse, and recently the large amount of public money that has been spent in conserving and restoring the site and making it accessible to the public. You will appreciate from earlier letters that the Pine Lodge site, located just within the south-western registered boundary, was part of the woodland belt that contained the designed landscape and its range of special buildings. Pine Lodge site is also within the Wentworth Castle and Stainborough Park Conservation Area.

As we wrote in our letter of 5th August 2021, the GT and YGT consider that although the existing bungalow contributes little to the surrounding historic assets, its low form and reduced visibility in the landscape render its impact as neutral. However, we would support its demolition if the new building responded to this part of the designed landscape as we discussed.

We note that the massing and overall design of the building remain, but its impact has been reduced somewhat with the removal of the dormer windows formerly proposed.

Regarding the glazing in general, we are pleased that there is no glazing on the north side of the garage roof which may help to screen that of the house although this will be limited owing to the topography.

We are concerned about the very large gable windows on the east and west elevations – the east gable window is the most concerning as it faces over a wide area of parkland and we think would be intrusive. We are disappointed to see on the Landscape Layout the retention of the proposal for a ‘primary vista from the proposed dwelling’ from the glazed eastern gable.

There are also six varying sized rooflights facing north towards the main Wentworth Castle building and designed area that includes Stainborough Castle, Archer’s Hill Gate and the Sun Monument. The light shed and the potential glare from these and the gable windows will be a distraction in this very important historic landscape. We wonder if there is scope for having all the rooflights on the north side of the house at the lower level as per the south elevation, which might help reduce the impact a little more.

We have not seen an assessment of the views from the parkland comparing the existing bungalow with what is proposed which would help assess the impact on significance. We think that the proposals will inevitably increase the visibility of this property.

We are pleased to see that a landscaping scheme has now been developed which helps to assimilate the domestic nature of the property into the wider landscape. The inclusion of estate railings to the boundaries increases the permeability of the site, and the reinstatement of the ‘avenue’ to the east boundary represents a positive enhancement to the scheme.

Although there have been positive revisions, the Gardens Trust and Yorkshire Gardens Trust still considers that the proposal will cause harm to the significance of the Grade I registered landscape. Your authority will need to judge whether the harm is balanced by the public benefits of replacing the deteriorating existing bungalow and whether the proposal complies with the NPPF (July 2021), paras 199-202 and the Barnsley Local Plan Policy HE1 (The Historic Environment) and HE4 (Developments affecting Historic Areas or Landscapes). We are of the opinion that it does not.

We also have concerns about the Coal Mining Risk Assessment June 2019 and the points regarding the bore hole exploration (Risk Assessment & Method Statement for Geoenvironmental Survey, Patrick Parsons January 2020) that we wrote about in our letter of 5th August 2021. The report advises that more exploration needs to be carried out prior to building which could well invalidate the new house position and compromise the tree and shrub planting.

We understand that the current proposals have not reached a detailed stage and strongly advise that your authority ensures that there is no diminution between any permission granted and the completed scheme and that the landscape scheme is implemented to the highest standards. This is important in reducing the ‘domestic/suburban’ character of the site. The latter should be in place before completion and occupation. We also advise that permitted development rights should be removed and strongly advise that safeguards are put in place to ensure that all these aspects are adhered to for years to come.

In the light of our concerns the Gardens Trust and Yorkshire Gardens Trust maintain their objection to the current proposals.

Yours sincerely

Val Hepworth
Trustee Conservation and Planning

Cc cc. Chris Mayes, Landscape Architect North of England, Historic England,
e-yorks@historicengland.org.uk; Conservation@ the Gardens Trust, Natasha Rowland, National Trust